# **Proton remains puzzling**

## Proton mass, spin, charge radius and even new physics

### Haiyan Gao Duke University and Duke Kunshan University





### Nuclear physics is the study of the structure of matter

- Most of the visible mass and energy in the universe around us comes from nuclei and nuclear reactions.
- The nucleus is a unique form of matter in that all the forces of nature are present : (strong, electromagnetic, weak, and of course gravity).







### **QCD: still unsolved in non-perturbative region**





Gauge bosons: gluons (8)

- 2004 Nobel prize for ``asymptotic freedom"
- non-perturbative regime QCD ?????
- One of the top 10 challenges for physics!
- QCD: Important for discovering new physics beyond SM
- Nucleon structure is one of the most active areas

## Lepton scattering: powerful microscope!

- Clean probe of hadron structure
- Electron (lepton) vertex is well-known from QED
- One-photon exchange dominates, higher-order exchange diagrams are suppressed (two-photon physics)
- Vary the wave-length of the probe to view deeper inside

$$\frac{d\sigma}{d\Omega} = \frac{\alpha^2}{4E^2 \sin^4 \frac{\theta}{2}} \frac{E'}{E} \left( \frac{G_E^2 + \tau G_M^2}{1 + \tau} \cos^2 \frac{\theta}{2} + 2\tau G_M^2 \sin^2 \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \qquad \tau = -q^2 / 4M^2$$







## What is inside the proton/neutron?

### 1933: Proton's magnetic moment



Nobel Prize In Physics 1943

**Otto Stern** 

**Richard E. Taylor** 

#### 1960: Elastic e-p scattering



Nobel Prize In Physics 1961

**Robert Hofstadter** 

"for ... and for his discovery of the magnetic moment of the proton".

 $q \neq 2$ 



"for ... and for his thereby achieved discoveries concerning the structure of the nucleons"

Form factors  $\rightarrow$  Charge distributions

1969: Deep inelastic e-p scattering





Nobel Prize in Physics 1990 Jerome I. Friedman, Henry W. Kendall,

"for their pioneering investigations concerning deep inelastic scattering of electrons on protons ...". Jian-Wei Qiu

1974: QCD Asymptotic Freedom







Nobel Prize in Physics 2004 David J. Gross, H. David Politzer. Frank Wilczek

"for the discovery of asymptotic freedom in the theory of the strong 8 interaction".

### **Proton: a fascinating many-body relativistic system** Higgs discovery almost irrelevant to proton mass



$$H_{QCD} = H_q + H_m + Hg + H_a$$

$$H_q = \text{Quark energy } \int d^3x \ \psi^{\dagger} (-i\mathbf{D}\cdot\alpha) \ \psi$$

$$H_m = \text{Quark mass} \qquad \int d^3x \ \bar{\psi}m\psi$$

$$H_g = \text{Gluon energy } \int d^3x \ \frac{1}{2} (\mathbf{E}^2 + \mathbf{B}^2)$$

$$H_a = \text{Trace anomaly} \int d^3x \ \frac{9\alpha_s}{16\pi} (\mathbf{E}^2 - \mathbf{B}^2)$$
Sets the scale for the Hadron mass!
X. Ji PRL 74 1071 (1995)





## Spin Milestones and Proton Spin Puzzle

- Spin Milestones: (Nature)
  - 1896: Zeeman effect (milestone 1)
  - 1922: Stern-Gerlach experiment (2)
  - 1925: Spinning electron (Uhlenbeck/Goudsmit)(3)
  - 1928: Dirac equation (4)
  - Quantum magnetism (5)
  - 1932: Isospin(6)
  - 1935: Proton anomalous magnetic moment
  - 1940: Spin-statistics connection(7)
  - > 1946: Nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR)(8)
  - > 1971: Supersymmetry(13)
  - > 1973: Magnetic resonance imaging(15)
  - > 1980s: "Proton spin crisis" (now puzzle)
  - ➤ 1990: Functional MRI (19)
  - 1997: Semiconductor spintronics (23)
  - > 2000s: "New breakthrough in spin physics"?

### topological insulator, quantum anomalous Hall effect, etc.. the spin of the quarks!!

Nature: http://www.nature.com/milestones/milespin/index.html





Pauli and Bohr watch a spinning top

Proton spin taken for granted for coming from the spin of the quarks!! Impressive experimental progress in QCD spin physics in the last 25 years

## • Inclusive spin-dependent DIS → CERN: EMC, SMC, COMPASS ➡ SLAC: E80, E142, E143, E154, E155 → DESY: HERMES ➡ JLab: Hall A, B and C Semi-inclusive DIS ➡ SMC, COMPASS ➡ HERMES, JLab Polarized pp collisions ➡ BNL: PHENIX & STAR

Polarized e+e- collisions
 KEK: Belle

Z. Meziani





## Nucleon Spin Decomposition

### Proton spin puzzle



$$\Delta \Sigma = \Delta u + \Delta d + \Delta s \sim 0.3$$

Spin decomposition

$$J = \frac{1}{2}\Delta\Sigma + \Delta G + L_q + L_g$$



JAM Collaboration, PRD (2016).

Quark spin only contributes a small fraction to nucleon spin.

J. Ashman et al., PLB 206, 364 (1988); NP B328, 1 (1989).



### Access to L<sub>q/g</sub>

It is necessary to have transverse information.

Coordinate space: GPDs Momentum space: TMDs

3D imaging of the nucleon.

### Latest Lattice QCD results suggest 50% from gluon spin (Phys. Rev. Lett. 118, 102001)



### Generalized parton distribution (GPD) Transverse momentum dependent parton distribution (TMD)

[Bacchetta's talk (2016)]

# Lepton Scattering ----- A powerful tool



# **Unified View of Nucleon Structure**



## Leading Twist TMDs

→ Nucleon Spin→ Quark Spin

		Quark polarization			
		<b>Un-Polarized</b>	Longitudinally Polarized	Transversely Polarized	
Nucleon Polarization	U	$f_1 = \bullet$		$h_1^{\perp} = \begin{array}{c} \uparrow \\ Boer-Mulder \end{array}$	
	L		$g_1 = +$ Helicity	$h_{1L}^{\perp} = \checkmark - \checkmark$	
	т	$f_{1T}^{\perp} = \underbrace{\bullet}_{\text{Sivers}}^{\bullet} - \underbrace{\bullet}_{\text{t}}^{\bullet}$	$g_{1T}^{\perp} = \underbrace{{\bullet}}_{-} - \underbrace{{\bullet}}_{\bullet}$	$h_{1T} = \underbrace{_{1}}_{} - \underbrace{_{1}}_{}$ Transversity $h_{1T}^{\perp} = \underbrace{_{2}}_{} - \underbrace{_{2}}_{}$ Pretzelosity	



### Separation of Collins, Sivers and pretzelocity effects through angular dependence

$$A_{UT}(\varphi_h^l,\varphi_S^l) = \frac{1}{P} \frac{N^{\uparrow} - N^{\downarrow}}{N^{\uparrow} + N^{\downarrow}}$$
  
=  $A_{UT}^{Collins} \sin(\phi_h + \phi_S) + A_{UT}^{Sivers} \sin(\phi_h - \phi_S)$   
+  $A_{UT}^{Pretzelosity} \sin(3\phi_h - \phi_S)$   
 $A_{UT}^{Collins} \propto \left\langle \sin(\phi_h + \phi_S) \right\rangle_{UT} \propto h_1 \otimes H_1^{\bot}$  Collins frag. Func.  
from e<sup>+</sup>e<sup>-</sup> collisions  
 $A_{UT}^{Sivers} \propto \left\langle \sin(\phi_h - \phi_S) \right\rangle_{UT} \propto f_{1T}^{\bot} \otimes D_1$   
 $A_{UT}^{Pretzelosity} \propto \left\langle \sin(3\phi_h - \phi_S) \right\rangle_{UT} \propto h_{1T}^{\bot} \otimes H_1^{\bot}$ 

SIDIS SSAs depend on 4-D variables (x,  $Q^2$ , z and  $P_T$ ) Large angular coverage and precision measurement of asymmetries in 4-D phase space is essential.

# 12 GeV Upgrade at JLab



Solenoidal Large Intensity Device (SoLID) proposed for Hall A

## **Solenoidal Large Intensity Device (SoLID) Physics**

SoLID provides unique capability:

- ✓ high luminosity (10<sup>37-39</sup>)
- $\checkmark$  large acceptance with full  $\phi$  coverage



→ multi-purpose program to maximize the 12-GeV science potential

1) Precision in 3D momentum space imaging of the nucleon





2) Precise determination of the electroweak couplings

### SIDIS @ SoLID:

An unprecedented tool to unravel the rich structure and dynamics of nucleon structure in the valence region and the inner working of QCD



Tensor charge & EDM



 $d_n = \delta_T u \, d_u + \delta_T d \, d_d + \delta_T s \, d_s$ 

neglect strange quark contribution

# Next generation nEDM constraint



SoLID projections based on Kang et al 2015 using different nEDM upper limits



### **PVDIS@SoLID:** Ultimate PVDIS measurement

Searching for Physics Beyond the Standard Model

An asymmetry is measured:  $A_{PV} = \frac{1}{2}$ 





- Sensitive to fundamental
   couplings 2C<sub>2u</sub>-C<sub>2d</sub>
- Charge symmetry violation
   in the parton distribution
   functions
- Clean measurement of d/u ratio in the valence

region



Results from the PVDIS experiment, Wang et al., Nature 506 NO. 7486, 67 (2014) together with projected results from PVDIS@SoLID

Projected mass limits for composite models.

Purple region is excluded by published data

**Orange** region is the projected reach with SoLID and final Qweak result

Sensitive to new physics, example: Leptophobic Z'

# J/Psi@ SoLID: The threshold region, the mass of the proton and the LHCb charmed pentaquark

Measure the contribution of the gluons to the mass of the proton directly.
 Poduce and determine the quantum numbers of the LHCb pentaquark if it exist.

LHCb Pentaquark production





```
How does QCD generate the mass of the proton?

\Rightarrow \text{ Trace of the QCD energy-momentum tensor:}
T_{a}^{\alpha} = \frac{\beta(g)}{2g} F^{\mu\nu,a} F_{\mu\nu}^{a} + \sum_{q=u,d,s} m_{q}(1+\gamma_{m}) \bar{\psi}_{q} \psi_{q}
\beta(g) = -(11-2n_{f}/3)g^{3}/(4\pi)^{2} + \dots
```

••م

Laser Spectroscopy Division Hydrogen Project

# The Proton Size Puzzle



# **Proton Charge Radius**

- An important property of the nucleon
  - Important for understanding how QCD works
  - Challenge to Lattice QCD (exciting new results, Alexandrou et al.)
  - An important physics input to the bound state QED calculations, affects muonic H Lamb shift  $(2S_{1/2} 2P_{1/2})$  by as much as 2%
- Electron-proton elastic scattering to determine electric form factor (Nuclear Physics)

$$\sqrt{\langle r^2 \rangle} = \sqrt{-6 \frac{dG(q^2)}{dq^2}} |_{q^2=0}$$

- Spectroscopy (Atomic physics)
  - Hydrogen Lamb shift
  - Muonic Hydrogen Lamb shift



## Unpolarized electron-nucleon scattering (Rosenbluth Separation)

• Elastic e-p cross section

$$\frac{d\sigma}{d\Omega} = \frac{\alpha^2 \cos^2 \frac{\theta}{2}}{4E^2 \sin^4 \frac{\theta}{2}} \frac{E'}{E} \left( \frac{G_E^{p^2} + \tau G_M^{p^2}}{1 + \tau} + 2\tau G_M^{p^2} \tan^2 \frac{\theta}{2} \right)$$
$$= \sigma_M f_{rec}^{-1} \left( A + B \tan^2 \frac{\theta}{2} \right)$$

- At fixed Q<sup>2</sup>, fit  $d\sigma/d\Omega$  vs.  $tan^{2}(\theta/2)$ 
  - Measurement of absolute cross section
  - Dominated by either  $G_E$  or  $G_M$ 
    - Low  $Q^2$  by  $G_E$
    - High  $Q^2$  by  $G_M$

 $G_F$  or  $G_M$ 





$$\sigma_R = au G_M^2 + \epsilon G_E^2$$

$$\tau = \frac{Q^2}{4M^2}$$
$$\varepsilon = (1 + 2(1 + \tau)\tan^2\frac{\theta}{2})^{-1}$$

# Electron-proton elastic scattering with longitudinally polarized electron beam and recoil proton polarization measurement

 $G_E^p$ 

 $\overline{G}_{M}^{p}$ 

**Polarization Transfer** 

Recoil proton polarization



- Focal Plane Polarimeter
  - recoil proton scatters off secondary <sup>12</sup>C target
  - $\begin{array}{ll} & \mathsf{P}_{\mathsf{t}}, \, \mathsf{P}_{\mathsf{l}} \text{ measured from} \\ \phi \text{ distribution} \end{array}$
  - P<sub>b</sub>, and analyzing power cancel out in ratio







**Focal-plane polarimeter** 

### Asymmetry Super-ratio Method Polarized electron-polarized proton elastic scattering

• Polarized beam-target asymmetry

 $A_{exp} = P_b P_t \frac{-2\tau v_{T'} \cos \theta^* G_M^{p-2} + 2\sqrt{2\tau(1+\tau)} v_{TL'} \sin \theta^* \cos \phi^* G_M^p G_E^p}{(1+\tau) v_L G_E^{p-2} + 2\tau v_T G_M^{p-2}}$ 



• Super-ratio

$$R_A=rac{A_1}{A_2}=rac{a_1-b_1\cdot G_E^p/G_M^p}{a_2-b_2\cdot G_E^p/G_M^p}$$

BLAST pioneered the technique, later also used in Jlab Hall A experiment





### Tremendous advances in electron scattering



### **Unprecedented capabilities:**

- High Intensity
- High Duty Factor
- High Polarization
- Parity Quality Beams
- Large acceptance detectors
- State-of-the-art polarimetry, polarized targets



Polarized <sup>3</sup>He target



Focal plane polarimeter – Jefferson Lab 31

# Hydrogen Spectroscopy



The absolute frequency of H energy levels has been measured with an accuracy of 1.4 part in  $10^{14}$  via comparison with an atomic cesium fountain clock as a primary frequency standard.

```
Yields R_{\infty} (the most precisely known constant)
```

Comparing measurements to QED calculations that include corrections for the finite size of the proton provide an indirect but very precise value of the rms proton charge radius

Proton charge radius effect on the muonic hydrogen Lamb shift is 2%

### Muonic hydrogen Lamb shift at PSI (2010, 2013)



2010: new value is  $r_p = 0.84184(67)$  fm

## New PSI results reported in Science 2013



2013: r<sub>p</sub> = 0.84087(39) fm, A. Antognini *et al.*, Science 339, 417 (2013)

## **Recent ep Scattering Experiments**

Three spectrometer facility of the A1 collaboration:



- Large amount of overlapping data sets
- Statistical error  $\leq 0.2\%$
- Luminosity monitoring with spectrometer
- $Q^2 = 0.004 1.0 (GeV/c)^2$ result:  $r_p = 0.879(5)_{stat}(4)_{sys}(2)_{mod}(4)_{group}$

### Measurements @ Mainz



J. Bernauer, PRL 105,242001, 2010

5-7 $\sigma$  higher than muonic hydrogen result !

(J. Bernauer)

## JLab Recoil Proton Polarization Experimental



### **Proton Charge Radius from recent experiments and analyses**



### **Revisits QED Calculations....**

	An additional 0.31 meV to		
Contribution	Value	Uncertainty	match CODATA value
	[meV]	$[10^{-4} \text{ meV}]$	match CODATA value
Uehling	205.0282		
Källen–Sabry	1.5081		
VP iteration	0.151		
Mixed $\mu - e$ VP	0.00007	т 1	· 1 T · 1
Hadronic VP [21,23]	0.011	20 Eval	uation by Jentschura,
Sixth order VP [24]	0.00761	Anna	als Phys 326 500 (2011)
Whichmann-Kroll	-0.00103		1 (2011)
Virtual Delbrück	0.00135	Rece	ent summary by
Light-by-light	_	<sup>10</sup> A. A	ntognini et al., arXiv:1208.2637
Muon self-energy and muonic VP (2 <sup>nd</sup> order)	-0.66788		
Fourth order electron loops	-0.00169		
VP insertion in self energy [17]	-0.0055	<sub>10</sub> Birse a	nd McGovern, arXiv:1206.3030
Proton self–energy [18]	-0.0099	0.015(4	4) meV (proton polarizability)
Recoil [17,43]	0.0575	ΙM	Alarcon et al 1312 1219
Recoil correction to VP (one–photon)	-0.0041	0.101	$\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{v}$
Recoil (two-photon) [19]	-0.04497	0.00	J8 meV
Recoil higher order [19]	-0.0096		
Recoil finite size [32]	0.013	10	
Finite size of order $(Z\alpha)^4$ [32] $-5.1975(1) r_p^2$	-3.979	(620) G.A.	Miller, arXiv:1209.4667
Finite size of order $(Z\alpha)^5$ 0.0347(30) $r_p^3$	0.0232	(20)	
Finite size of order $(Z\alpha)^6$	-0.0005		
Correction to VP $-0.0109 r_p^2$	-0.0083	New	experiments at HIGS and
Additional size for VP [19] $-0.0164 r_p^2$	-0.0128		az on proton polarizabilitios
Proton polarizability [18,33]	0.015	40 IVIdII	iz on proton polarizabilities
Fine structure $\Delta E(2P_{3/2} - 2P_{1/2})$	8.352	10	
$2P_{3/2}^{r=2}$ hyperfine splitting	1.2724		
$2S_{1/2}^{F=1}$ hyperfine splitting [42], (-22.8148/4)	-5.7037	20	

## *Revisits of e-p scattering data (just 2015)*

- Re-analysis of existing proton form factor data
  - D. W. Higinbotham, arXiv:1510.01293: two parameter dipole form fit describes the data at both low Q<sup>2</sup> and high Q<sup>2</sup> well, and the result is consistent with PSI value
  - K. Griffioen, C. Carson, S. Maddox, arXiv:1509.06676: reanalysis of Mainz data, focusing on the low Q<sup>2</sup> part with a polynomial form fit.
  - M. Horbatsch and E. A. Hessels, arXiv:1509.05644: re-analysis of Mainz data, simple fits (one-parameter model, dipole model, linear model) for low Q2 data, and spline extension to high Q2 data, these fits can all describe data well, but the extracted radius varies from 0.84 ~ 0.89 fm. So current data is not able to resolve the puzzle.
  - J. Arrington, arXiv:1506.00873: re-analysis of world data, found the previous scattering results might underestimate the uncertainty.
  - Distler, Walcher, and Bernauer, arXiv1511.00479 All these studies emphasize even more the importance of low  $Q^2$  e-p scattering data

## New Physics or what? - Incomplete list

- New physics: new particles, Barger et al., Carlson and Rislow; Liu and Miller,....New PV muonic force, Batell et al.; Carlson and Freid; Extra dimension: Dahia and Lemos; Quantum gravity at the Fermi scale R. Onofrio;.....
- Contributions to the muonic H Lamb shift: Carlson and Vanderhaeghen,; Jentschura, Borie, Carroll et al, Hill and Paz, Birse and McGovern, G.A. Miller, J.M. Alarcon, Ji, Peset and Pineda....
- Higher moments of the charge distribution and Zemach radii, Distler, Bernauer and Walcher,.....
- J.A. Arrington, G. Lee, J. R. Arrington, R. J. Hill discuss systematics in extraction from ep data, no resolution on discrepancy
- Donnelly, Milner and Hasell discuss interpretation of ep data,..... Discrepancy explained by some but others disagree
- Dispersion relations: Lorentz et al.
- Frame transformation: D. Robson
- New experiments: Mainz (e-d, ISR), JLab (PRad), PSI (Lamb shift, and MUSE), H Lamb shift

### **PRad Experimental Setup in Hall B at JLab**



- High resolution, large acceptance, hybrid HyCal calorimeter (PbWO<sub>4</sub> and Pb-Glass)
- Windowless H<sub>2</sub> gas flow target
- Simultaneous detection of elastic and Moller electrons
- $Q^2$  range of  $2x10^{-4} 0.14$  GeV<sup>2</sup>
- XY veto counters replaced by GEM detector (3) ISR experiments at Mainz
- Vacuum box

Spokespersons: D. Dutta, H. Gao, A. Gasparian, M. Khandaker

Sub 1% measurements:

- (1) ep elastic scattering at Jlab (PRad)
- (2) μp elastic scattering at PSI 16 U.S.

institutions! (MUSE)

Ongoing H spectroscopy experiments<sup>2</sup>





I Indro con

#### PRad Setup (Side View)



- Two large area GEM detectors
- Small overlap region in the middle
- Excellent position
   resolution (72 μm)
- Improve position resolution of the setup by > 20 times
- Similar improvement for Q<sup>2</sup> determination at small angle



I Indra gar

#### PRad Setup (Side View)



- Hybrid EM calorimeter (HyCal)
  - Inner 1156 PWO<sub>4</sub> modules
  - Outer 576 lead glass modules
- 5.8 m from the target
- Scattering angle coverage: ~0.6° to 7.5°
- Full azimuthal angle coverage
- High resolution and efficiency



### HyCal Resolution and Efficiency

- HyCal energy resolution and trigger efficiency extracted using high energy photon beam from Hall B at Jlab
  - > 99.5% trigger efficiency obtained for  $E_{\gamma}$  > 500 MeV, for various parts of HyCal
  - Energy resolution  $\sim 2.5\%$  for PWO<sub>4</sub> part, lead glass part about 2.5 time worse



### Performance of GEM Detectors

- GEM detection efficiency measured in both photon beam calibration (pair production) and production runs (ep and ee)
- Using overlap region of GEMs to measure position resolution (72  $\mu$ m)



### **Preliminary Results:**



## **PRad Projected Result with world data**



# Summary and outlook

- After decades of study, proton remains puzzling
- Proton spin puzzle: orbital angular momentum through 3-d tomography (JLab 12 program, SoLID, and others) and future Electron Ion Collider
- Proton charge radius puzzle: PRad experiment and others –Stay tuned for more news about proton charge radius
- Proton mass puzzle: SoLID near-threshold J/psi production

Acknowledgement: the SoLID collaboration, and the PRad Collaboration (supported in part by U.S. Department of Energy under contract number DE-FG02-03ER41231, NSF MRI PHY-1229153)